

## Monitoring Report

### Implementation of Government Resolution towards representation

### of the Arab, Druze and Circassian Populations in Public Service

Based on Government Resolution 2579, 11.11.2007

And Resolution 4436, 25.1.2009

Four years later than the target date, and a decade after the Government Resolution to raise the representation rates of Arab employees in Government Bodies and Ministries to 10%, this target has been reached albeit impartially and inconsistently across the ministries. While the overall rate of Arab workers in Public Service passed the 10% mark, many of the Ministries, including those of critical relevance and importance to the Arab minority, remain with an insignificant level of Arab representation. For instance, the Ministry for Social Equality whose workforce comprises only 1.4% Arabs, and 1.8% at the Ministry for the Development of the Negev & Galilee – a stark underrepresentation considering that 80% of Arab citizens live in the Negev & Galilee.

### Background

The 31<sup>st</sup> Government of Israel, led by Ehud Olmert, passed two resolutions which promoted fair representation of Arab citizens in Public Service: **Resolution 2579** (passed on 11.11.2007) and **Resolution 4436** (passed on 25.01.2009). Among other components the resolutions defined operative mechanisms for lowering the barriers to Public employment for these populations, and to reach a target of 10% of State Employees who are Arab by the end of 2012.

Resolution 4436 dealt, among other measures, with subsidized rent and travel allowances for workers who live at a distance from their place of employment, raising the number of positions intended for minority employees, creating new positions for students, shortening the timeframe of making appointments, and, creating a plan for accessibilizing information. It was further decided that an onboarding program was to

be designed for new employees, and to create a group of Arab examiners to be integrated as members of the examination committees for public job tenders.

### Implementation in Practice

The target of the overall rate of Arab workers in Public Service of 10% was only reached midway through 2016, despite the resolution that this would be reached by the end of 2012.

The Government resolution also laid out that by 2012 all Government Ministries and Divisions would work with the Commission for Public Service and create 5 year plans promoting fair representation of Arab citizens. This did not happen. Furthermore, the Commission did not report in an orderly manner to the Ministerial Committee for Arab Sector Issues, and the Committee itself did not meet in 2016. The inter-ministerial team for lowering barriers to integrating Arab citizens into Public Service has not met since 2015. On top of this, insufficient information has been gathered in order to measure the efficiency of implementation of the resolution, which would be the basis for new policy making in this field.

### Key Findings:

- At the **Authority for the Advancement of Bedouin Society**, only 3 of the 61 employees are Arabs; and in the **Planning Authority** a similar rate of 4%.
- The **Commission for Public Service**, the division intended to lead the reform of integrating Arab employees, only 4.9% of its workforce are Arab (15 out of 304 employees).
- Among the 40 employees of the **Government Publication Bureau**, there is not a single Arab.
- **Finance Ministry** – 3%; **Education Ministry** – 8.5%; **Economy Ministry** – 6.34%; **Transport Ministry** – 8.1%.
- 62.5% of Interior Ministry employees are Arabs (430 out of 687) however an analysis of the data reveals that many of these are Religious Workers, such as Qadis in the Sharia Court System and Imams of Mosques, employed in roles preordained for Muslim Arabs.

- In the Health system the situation is relatively good: the Health Bureau for the Northern District – 50%; Poriya Hospital (Tiberius) – 30%; Ziv Hospital (Tzfat) 26%; the Health Center for the Western Galilee (Nahariya) – 26%; Rambam Hospital (Haifa) – 20%. However, the levels within the Health Ministry itself stand at only 3.5%.
- The situation is also relatively good at the Welfare Ministry with 12.1% of its workforce being Arab, and the Justice Ministry with 9.9%, however only 3.5% of the Administration of the Law Courts are Arab.

### Resolution Components and Implementation Status

	Component	Status	Implementation
1	<b>10% of Public Service positions staffed by Arab, Druze and Circassian employees by 2012</b>	Target reached in full mid-2016	Implemented (delay of 4 years)
2	Ministries present <b>5 year work plan</b> to Public Service Commission	No workplans have been submitted to the Commission, neither have there been quarterly reports on implementation.	Not implemented
3	<b>30% of positions</b> annually to be pre-assigned to Arab, Druze and Circassian populations.	There is no information of positions which have been pre-assigned to Arab society. Overall one third of all positions are pre-assigned to all entitled populations, therefore the target of 30% solely to Arab society has not been met.	Not implemented
4	<b>Conditioning of all new positions</b> at all Ministries on integration targets	No direct linkage has been formalized between lack of reaching targets to assigning new positions. In practice the Commission halts recruitment for ministries who have not presented a plan for fair representation.	Not implemented

5	Formation of <b>Inter-Ministerial Team</b>	“The Inter-Ministerial team to lower barriers to integrating employees from the Arab population in Public Service” was established, and its recommendations adopted in	Implemented
6	Subsidized rent and travel allowances for workers who live at a distance from their place of employment	The budget was approved but there has been no monitoring of the implementation or its effectiveness.	Partially Implemented
7	Every Government Ministry to receive an additional staff position for every position filled by an Arab employee.	By 2012 positions were added. The stimulus was cancelled due to budget cuts, and since then one third of new positions have been assigned to entitled populations, but no additional positions have been added as a stimulus to integration.	Partially Implemented
8	Provision of 37.5 Positions suitable for students, per annum	In 2015 there were 161 Arab students working in Public Service. This represent only 5.6% of all students employed in Public Service. Since 2012 the Commission has not created or held student positions specifically for the Arab population.	Partially Implemented
9	Program for accessibilizing information on job openings; and, shortening time allocated for filling new positions.	Until 2014, the Commission worked to publish job tenders in Arabic through collaboration with the CSO “Kav Mashve” and a special internet site (not operational).	Partially Implemented

		Attempts made to shorten process for filling new positions, but no emphasis on Arab candidates.	
10	Onboarding course for all new appointments, explaining Public Service and the work of the relevant Ministry.	This exists for all new employees in Public Service.	Implemented
11	<b>Integrating Arab examiners into examination committees for job tenders in Public Service</b>	Database of 200 employees established.	Implemented, but the Commission does not have quantitative data
		The Commission does not obligate the appointment of Arabs to the tender committee, and there is a lack of Arab employees at the required level to fulfil this role.	
12	The Commission will report bi-annually to the Ministerial Committee of Arab Sector Affairs, on the progress of the implementation of the resolutions. The Director of each Ministry not meeting its target will be summoned to the Committee.	The committee barely met, in 2016 it did not meet once.	Not implemented

## Insights and Conclusions

### 1. Unambitious Target

The Arab citizen population of Israel represents 20.8% of the general population. The 2 Government resolutions covered in this report were passed in 2007 and 2009, and set a

target of 10% Arab representation in Public Service by 2012. From the outset this target was unambitious, and did not aim for proportional representation. In 2012 the employment level of Arabs in Public Service was 8.37% of the workforce, and only in 2016 did the State hit the target it set for itself, at a major delay.

### Reaching the Target through Internal Trade-offs

The dispersion of workers between different divisions reveals that certain ministries, such as the Interior Ministry which includes many religious roles for the Muslim community, “compensate” for other Ministries who are under-achieving. There exist ministerial divisions which have understandable challenges for employing Arab citizens, such as Rabbinic Courts, Ministry of Religions and the Intelligence Community based at the PMO. However, in the majority of Government divisions, there is no justification for the major disparities in employment. Standing out for positive recognition is the Justice Ministry which reached the target and 10% of its workforce are Arabs; while the Ministries of Social Equality, Finance, Development of Negev and Galilee are all under 3%. (see attached table).

The fact that individual ministries were not obligated to reach a target of 10% created a low motivation for improvement and low levels of integration across many Ministries. Furthermore, fair representation of Arab citizens does not deal solely with percentage of employees from specific populations, but also to the senior level of management, key positions, and gender balance, as the State acts towards other populations.

## 2. Employment of Arab Women

The data on fair representation of the Arab population shows more Arab men being accepted into Public Service positions than women. Since June 2014 the Commission for Public Service has been working to promote women's employment in Public Service, following the framework of Resolution 1697 that adopted the recommendations of the Strauber Commission. On this background, there is a disappointing lack of specific policy targeting the barriers to employment in Public Service faced by Arab women.

### 3. Lack of Updated Policy Decisions

Both of the Government Resolutions covered in this report were passed during the candidacy of the 31<sup>st</sup> Government under Ehud Olmert, and created mechanisms for raising representation until 2012. Since the latter Resolution passed in 2009 there has not been further Government Resolutions, no new targets have been set, no analysis of the effectivity of the stimuli in which the State invested, and no utilization of active recruitment tools for the benefit of the Arab population. This is even more conspicuous in light of the fact that the last three years have marked significant Government action in promoting integration of the Ultra-Orthodox population, and women, in Public Service. In these efforts the Government developed more innovative tools than those for Arab representation – for instance, candidate databases.

### 4. Lack of Measurement and Data

The Government Resolutions for promoting fair representation of the Arab population included a basket of stimuli and tools to promote integration. For example: Subsidizing rent, designing work plans, setting Ministry-specific targets, budgeting for new positions, and more. In order to judge the effectiveness of the use of these tools there is a need for tracking and monitoring of measurable outcomes. In the process of compiling this report, requests were submitted to the different Government Ministries, in many of the requests made it became clear that there had not been information gathering as stipulated by the Resolution. This is a major obstacle to measuring the effectiveness of the different mechanisms created by the Resolutions, and harms the capacity of future policy decisions in the field of fair representation in Public Service.

### 5. Absence of overseeing, regulatory body

Today there exists no function at the Commission for Public Service which deals with fair representation, neither for responding to request from individuals or in coordinating the

policy on this issue. The reporting and regulatory mechanisms which the Resolutions lay out, such as 5 year plans and reporting to the Ministerial Committee, did not take place, a fact which is manifest in the impartial implementation of the Government Resolution, in the lack of measurements, and the absence of contemporary policy which would reassess targets and address the ongoing and significant underrepresentation of the Arab population in Public Service.